COMPARATIVE STUDY OF TEACHING EFFECTIVENESS OF TRAINED AND UNTRAINED TEACHERS AT SCHOOL LEVEL WORKING IN PRIVATE SECTOR

Abdul Qayyum Ch.[1*], Syeda Mahnaz Hassan[2], Aneela Sheikh[3] and Nuzhat Mustafa[4]

[1]Centre of Career Counseling, University of the Punjab, Lahore. Pakistan

*Corresponding Author: **Email: careerpu@yahoo.com**

[2]Department of Social Work, University of the Punjab, Lahore. Pakistan

[3]Dar-e-Arqam Schools, Lahore. Pakistan

ABSTRACT*: The study compared the professional skills of trained and untrained teachers towards effective teaching in private sector schools. The convenient sampling technique was employed in this descriptive cross-sectional study. A total of 30 private schools were selected from Lahore city and from each school 6 trained and 6 untrained teachers were selected for the study to whom the research instrument was administered. The sample consisted of a total of 360 private school teachers. Five point likert scale questionnaire was developed, including four important factors regarding teaching effectiveness, i.e.,lesson plan, instructional material, task orientation and ideas and contribution of students. The study found that for these above mentioned factors, there was no significant difference between the effectiveness of trained and untrained teachers in private sector schools. The study recommended that for enhancing the teaching effectiveness, enthusiastic teachers must be recruited, and should be assessed for their skills and competency in vocabulary, pronunciation, grammar and content delivery. Teachers training workshops should be frequently conducted by the institute to improve teaching effectiveness, through different aspects, i.e., assessing students' results, when making decisions about students' progress, teaching plans, developing and implementation of curriculum and organizing co-curricular activities. Teachers must be aware of the latest methodologies and teaching techniques to fortify their lessons.*

Keywords: Trained teachers, Effective teaching, Private schools, Lesson plan, Instructional material, Task orientation

INTRODUCTION

It is believed that effective training should lead to quality teaching and thus to higher level of students achievement. Education is a never ending process, training and education are so closely and mutually related to each other and no one can separate one from the other.

The most burning issue is that Global village has become a challenge for the present educational systems. Additionally it has drastic effects on the effectiveness of trained and untrained teachers. The way training shapes our attitudes and performance has always been a matter of keen interest for educational experts. The big challenge in this regard is how to measure not just the product, but also the process of training.

In Pakistan, educational polices and development plans have given full attention to the pivotal role of quality teacher and have decided the preparation of effective teacher to raise the standard of education. Plans are made, but implementation is not properly done. Islam holds teaching as a challenging profession and emphasize the need for adequate preparation of teacher to enable them to shoulder the heavy responsibilities of nation building. So, the importance of teacher training is obvious even from our religion.

A trained teacher alone can know the requirements of effective teaching with the help of a training procedure. The teachers also come across the obstacles of learning process and the ways in which he can overcome these obstacles. The need of teacher training is vital in any educational system.

Pakistan faces major problems with low achievement levels of students and high rate of dropout and course repetition. The main reason of this low achievement levels are, insufficiently trained teacher, and the lack of instructional materials, inadequate supervision and physical facilities. Pre-service and in-service training programmes are not fully effective in imparting classroom skills and upgrading subject matter competence.

In teachers training, the greatest challenge is to inspire teachers and educators professional excellence. Effective pre-service professional preparations lead to professional commitment and excellence in teaching. Another major problem that Pakistan is facing today is the untrained teachers in private schools that we can see in almost every street. Government schools are still using very old curriculum especially at primary level. This is the reason that majority of people are forced to enroll their children in private schools. But these small level schools don't bother to employ professional trained teachers and sometimes not even qualified enough. They are exploiting the children and their parents on the name of so-called English Medium Schools. The curriculum of these schools is based on few oxford books, and the teachers do not know how to implement this curriculum. They have burdened the students with heavy work load. The need is to solve this problem which is destroying our society's educational quality.

Teaching and learning are dynamic processes that are constantly being adapted to changing needs and opportunities. The effectiveness of any institute depends on the style of their teaching, organization of school, management of class, teacher and student relationship, learning environment and methodology of assessing the student. In this study researchers will compare the effectiveness of trained and untrained teachers working in private sector, and how much difference lies there in the learning and achievement between the students of trained and untrained teachers of teaching and learning. Researchers may analyze the effectiveness of the teaching, their organization, schooland community relationship, teacher performance and

student achievement, administrative structure and, building and location as well.

Effective teachers are one of the main pillars in the building of an effective school. Trained teachers have a firm knowledge of their respective disciplines, knowledge of students' learning problems and knowledge of curriculum implementation. Trained teachers know the cognitive route to increase students' interest in the subject and enhance students learning. The trained teachers emphasize towards the subject understanding and also adopt activity based learning.

The present study is very important because the educational system of each school demands trained and competent teachers, it is also important because the government wants to promote the quality of teaching through training, by comparing trained and untrained teachers in private schools of Pakistan. It will also emphasize the need and importance of teachers' training for effective teaching.

The study will compare the professional skills of teachers. It will help in comparing the trained and untrained teachers towards effective teaching in private school sector. This comparison will draw an attention that the teaching of trained teachers is more effective as compare to untrained teachers.Teaching is process that is so complex that to give it any particular definition is too difficult, this is an art that has no appeal when it is described only in a single word. Teaching is importation of knowledge to an individual by another individual in the school.

LITERATURE REVIEW

In Pakistan, the educational system,which is comprised of two main settings; government and private sector schools are different in their management, curriculum, funding, learning and work environment. Although, the responsibility and management of education delivery system has been shifted to the district level under the umbrella of Devolution Plan 2001, the government sector still relies on the state budget. In government schools, primary education is almost free with nominal fee structure, but the condition of these schools is very poor. Whereas, the environment of private schools is better and are run by sole proprietors and NGOs. The fee structure of private school is very high as compared to government schools, ranging from Rs. 116- per month to Rs. 3766/- per month [1, 2].

Teaching is a complex and demanding task with specialized skills and subject knowledge to have a significant impact on students. It is based on research that teacher's quality determines the variation in student's achievement. The research asserts that, in order to be effective, teachers must have a deep understanding of subject matter combined with teaching skills, strategies, and practices. These qualities assure high quality students' learning and achievement.

Private Schools expansions:

Private school expansion is also favored on the grounds that charging fees increases accountability of schools towards parents and potentially also increases efficiency. Under certain conditions, competition generated through the emergence of private schools may also improve efficiency of stagnant government sectors. It is suggested that organizational differences and differences in teacher incentives between private and government schools may be

important. Arguments do not affect the equity argument – where people feel they have no alternative either 'effective' than government schools in Pakistan [1, 2]. In their study of schooling choices of low-income families in urban Lahore find that private schools catering to the urban poor charge low fees.

Features of effective teaching:

The following commonalities were found in the research conducted on the characteristics of school effectiveness in Malaysia:

- Effective teaching and learning
- Effective evaluation and monitoring
- Positive Learning Environment
- Common goals and visions comprising collegiality and collaboration between teachers
- Focused professional Development
- Effective parental involvement
- A determined, strong and welcoming principal

Model of professional learning:(Department of Education & Training, 2004)

Leadership Qualities:

Dynamic and visionary leaders are needed who must be equipped with professional knowledge of effective learning techniques to enhance the student's achievements. The leaders should work as a guide and mentor and provide resource materials to the students, see problem solving approach, enhance the student's risk taking capability, visit other educational institutions to seek innovative models, create a liaison between team members and develop a linkage with outside expertise to expedite the effective learning in the school. The appropriateness of any specific model depends upon the objectives of any learning program.

Student's Evaluation:

The evaluation of students' work facilitates the teachers to comprehend how pupils think. This allows them to develop suitable teaching and learning plans for the students.At first, the teachers ascertain a clear attention for their work and what results do they anticipate. The discussions focus on the techniques with which instructors can improve their teaching on the basis of what they have learned about student's understanding of significant conceptions.

DISCUSSION ON CASE STUDIES

The discussions on case studies afford teachers with the opportunity to depict on learning and teaching by probing videotapes or descriptive stories representing classroom,school, learning or teaching conditions. Case discussions improve thoughtful discussion and augment teacher's capability to pronounce, examine and assess their coaching [3].

Peer observation:

Being observed and getting explicit feedback or observing others is one of the most effective ways to learn. Analysis and reflection on this evidence can be a valued means of specialized development. The most valuable annotations are well-planned, engrossed on particular issues and with follow-up to file enhancements. Peer reflectionendorses an open milieu where public dialogue of teaching is supported andencouraged.

Lesson Study:
Itsupports teachers to develop lesson plans and have in-depth understanding of how pupils understand particular subject material. Its aim is to promote a progression whereby instructors experience slow and gradual expert development through the combined development of lessons [4].

Communication Skills:
The teachers face the task of managing a school, dealing with student'sproblems and sustaining contended staff. Good communication is imperative for a school manager to be effective in his job of developing and upholding a vigorous learning environment. By using nonverbal and verbal communication skills, one can enhance a schools' organizational flow, which results in positive fortification for staff and safe precincts for students [5].

Social, economic considerations:
In some countries the prevalence of unemployment is attributed to poor curricula. As in many other counties, demands are made for curricula that will promote entrepreneurship and technical skills, and which enable school leavers to create employment for them, rather than become job seekers. Questions have been raised regarding the extent to which the school can adequately address technical skills development and whether school education should concentrate on the basic competencies needed for adult life. Such competencies would include, problem-solving, decision-making, analysis and communication skills, as well as those which are not trade specific, such' as designing and pattern-making, etc.

Exposure to new technologies:
These often serve to provoke and encourage curriculum reform, since school leavers often find that they need new skills and knowledge to live and work in the modem world.

Appropriate research:
Research often helps to identify those curriculum areas that require in-depth assessment.

External interventions:
The work of international organizations and conferences (such as The World Conference on Education for All), and the work of external agencies and financial institutions, such as UNESCO, and The World Bank, all bring influence to bear on the development and formulation of curriculum projects.

Curriculum evaluation:
A careful evaluation is essential throughout the implementation process. Some of the main requirements are:
a) To determine which elements should be evaluated, e.g.: the content, the methods used, the findings, etc.
b) The selection of the best way to conduct an evaluation.
c) The selection of the best way to collect data, e.g. through observation, questionnaires, or interviews.
d) The collection, analysis and use of data, for the purpose of improving the curricular reform programmed.
In some countries evaluation is first made by means of consultations with local leaders and chiefs, and with the teachers of subjects in schools.
There are six main areas that should be evaluated.
They are:

1. Human resources
- The qualifications of the teachers
- The number of teachers per subject
- The number of male and female teachers
- The number pupils per teacher
- The education supervisors

2. Pupils
- Educational achievement
- Social and economic background
- Type of learning experiences
- The number of male and female pupils
- The number of handicapped pupils
- Discipline

3. Learning Environment
- School location
- School administration
- Facilities: e.g. laboratories, library, number of classrooms, sports ground, etc.
- Leisure facilities, e.g. clubs, sports, cleanliness, discipline community

4. Instructional Materials
- Number of textbooks available per subject and per pupil
- Number of teachers' guides available
- Number of lesson plans used
- Number of chalkboards
- Number of wall charts on display or available
- Number of flip charts used
- Number of school or class library books
- Equipment for the teaching of science, health, or sports activities

5. Methods of Teaching
- Rote learning
- Teacher dominated instruction
- Group work
- Multi-grade teaching
- Inter-active learning
- Use of learning aids, e.g.: radio or TV programmes, cassette players, etc.
- Activity-oriented teaching

6. Other areas
- Teachers' relations with other school staff and with the school principal, supervisors, curriculum developers, policy makers, the community, etc.
- Evaluation findings will include assessment of:
- Cognitive skills (e.g. in science and technology, literacy and numeracy, etc.)
- Affective skills (Hawley&Valli, 1999).

Need of effectiveness
Generally, "educational effectiveness" comprises instructional and school effectiveness. Instructional effectiveness refers to effectiveness improving conditions related to the classroom level and teachers, whereas, school effectiveness relates to those conditions which are defined at school level for enhancing the effectiveness. Multi-layer definitions, in which classroom level and school level conditions, and generally conditions in the bigger perspective of the school are also included, are at times denoted as

integrated educational effectiveness models or integrated

Importance of educational effectiveness

It is usually believed that private schools provide better quality education and infrastructure and thus are more effective as compared to government schools in Pakistan. This perception regarding private schools has been established as usually these are English-medium schools; they show better raw exam results than government schools and occasionally they are affiliated with international secondary education exam boards, which are considered to pay off in later life in terms of enhanced labor market returns. Arif & Saqib [2] and Alderman, *et al* [1] found that private schools are better in imparting knowledge to students at primary education level. This issue is still unconfirmed at the middle-level. In most developing countries, owing to the small size of the private sector, it cannot be compared with public sector, but according to the available data, this is not true in case of Pakistan. The comparative efficacy of different school types can be assessed using any one of the two approaches. The effectiveness of private schooling is usually measured in the shape of better earnings amid graduates of numerous school types.

Effective schools and professional learning

The lucidity regarding quality of teaching and agreed expectations are very important for an effective school for enhancing student performance. A relentless focus on learning and teaching is ingrained in the ethos of an effective school. With the support of effective leadership, such schools consistently offer learning opportunities for educators and instructors to enhance their knowledge, personalities and skills required to teach to high professional standards.

Principles of effective teaching

Wang &Walberg [7] published a recent review and illustrated the following twelve principles of effective teaching:

Supportive classroom environment: Students learn efficiently within organized and considerate learning groups. The teacher's role as a Socializer and a model is accentuated.

Learning Opportunities: Student's learning, enhance when the majority of their time is apportioned to curriculum related activities. Classroom management system stresses engaging students in such activities.

Curricular configuration: Curriculum components are associated to create a unified program for achieving instructional goals.

Establishing learning orientations: Educators can organize students for learnedness by giving a preliminary edifice to elucidate intended upshots and nod anticipated learning strategies.

Articulate content: Content is developed and explicitly explained with an accent on its structure to assist in eloquent learning and student retention. The effective teachers organize content in such a way as to maximize its "learner friendliness" and clarity.

Thoughtful discourse: Questions are intelligently planned to engross students in constant structured discourse about potent ideas.

Practice and application activities: Students require experiential learning opportunities for what they have learnt and to obtain improvement-oriented response.

school effectiveness models.

Scaffolding students' task engagement: The teacher affords whatsoever assistance is required by the students.

Group learning: Students usually take advantage by working in small groups to develop understandings or assisteach other to master skills.

Goal-oriented assessment: The teacher uses different formal and informal valuation methods to observe progress toward learning goals.

Achievement expectations: The teacher develops and follows-up on adequate prospects for learning upshots [8].

Skills and knowledge of an effective teacher

Effective expert knowledge emphases on evolving the essential characteristics of an effective teacher. It improves teacher's understanding of the curriculum.They teach students using various strategies which facilitate their students to acquire that syllabus. It is aimed at providing instructors with the abilities to educate and evaluate for profound understanding and to advance student's intellectual skills.

Department of Education & Training's Dimensions of Teaching and Professional Standards (2004) has defined the knowledge and skills of an effective teacher. It covers the following three components:

Teaching

A process by which a person assists other persons for their learning, knowledge and personality grooming is called teaching. It is one of the most significant activities. Teaching facilitates people to develop attitudes which they need to become responsible inhabitants, earn a decent living and lead peaceful lives. It is one of the major ways to transmit knowledge to the next generations.

Principle of the feedback and reinforced classroom; Skills needed by the Teachers:

Teachers shall:

- have the know-how to utilize the most useful learning and teaching techniques to empower students to make advancement;
- be able to evaluate what their students understand, discern and can do; and then utilize this evaluation to plan forthcoming learning and teaching activities;
- have great prospects for all of their students irrespective of their gender, race, ability or class; and
- have the know-how to persuade their students. For this, they themselves are required to be role models for their students.

Characteristics of effective teachers

The literature regarding teacher's effectiveness has mentioned various characteristics of an effective teacher:

- can teach the class as a whole;
- can present skills or information evidently and energetically;
- can keep the teaching sessions task-based;
- non-evaluative and can keep education relaxed;
- can have high prospects for achievement; and
- can relate contentedly with students (decreasing behavioural problems).

Muijs& Reynolds [9] identified the characteristics of structured teaching, as mainly pertinent to endorsing

intellectual achievement in the rudimentary skill areas,particularly in schools serving greater parts of socio-economically deprived clusters. Besides, evaluations of constructivist methods to teaching,as compared with more conventional approaches,designate that there is little substantiation that these boost achievement levels and outcomes specify that such methods may be less suitable for newer, low accomplishing and low SES clusters,inclining to broaden the attainment gap.

Teacher effectiveness researches in UK haveestablished a model which relates three factors; teaching skills, classroom climate and professional characteristics to progress. The teacher's part in making an excellent classroom environment is stressed.

METHODOLOGY

The study was descriptive cross-sectional in nature. The major aim of this study was to compare the teaching effectiveness of trained and untrained teachers.

SAMPLING PROCEDURES

A convenient sampling technique was employed in the study. A total of 30 private schools were selected from Lahore city, from each school 6 trained and 6 untrained teachers were selected to which the research instrument was administered. The sample consisted of a total of 360 private school teachers.

INSTRUMENTATION

On the basis of related literature, a five point likert scale questionnaire was developed, including four important factors regarding teaching effectiveness, i.e.,

i.   lesson plan
ii.   instructional material
iii.   task orientation
iv.   ideas and contribution of students

DATA ANALYSIS

The data collected was organized, arranged and interpreted according to objectives of the study.

Key codes were allotted to the variables, i.e., trained teachers =1 and untrained teachers =2. The data was collected on a five point likert scale, each statement was allotted a score; as strongly agree (SA) 5, agree (A) 4, undecided (U) 3, disagree (D) 2, and strongly disagree (SA). The data collected was analyzed by applying a t-Test. Level of significance was kept at $p<0.05$.

Table 4.1 shows that the value of t-test varies from 0.14 to 1.85 and p- value ranges from 0.17 to 0.88, which is greater than 0.05, therefore it is concluded that there is no significance difference between trained and untrained teachers for the factor, "lesson plan".

Table 4.2 shows that the value of t- test varies from 0.04 to .0.98 and p-value ranges from 0.32 to 0.96, all values are greater than 0.05. Therefore, there is no significant difference between trained and untrained teachers for the factor, "use of instructional material".

Table 4.3 shows that the value of t-test varies from 0.01 to 1.4 and the its p-value ranges from 0.01 to 0.98. All the p-values are greater than 0.05, except one statement. It is concluded that overall there is no significant difference between trained and untrained teachers for the factor, "task orientation".

Table 4.4 shows that the value of t- test varies from 0.03 to 1.25 and p-value 0.25 these shows that all p values are greater than 0.05. It is concluded that there is no significant difference between trained and untrained teachers for the factor, "use of students' ideas and contribution".

Table 4.1: Mean, Standard deviation and p-values of the statements related to factor (lesson plan).

Statement	Type	Mean	SD	t	p-value
You plan your lesson daily	Trained	4.64	.48	.74	.45
	Untrained	4.57	.49		
In your lesson plan You explain the lesson with daily life example	Trained	4.53	.68	.61	.54
	Untrained	4.60	.58		
In your lesson plan You demonstrate the lesson attractively and Effectively.	Trained	4.41	.65	.85	.37
	Untrained	4.38	.63		
In your lesson plan You give the summary at the end of the lesson.	Trained	4.62	.61	.14	.17
	Untrained	4.63	.48		
In your lesson plan you make your lesson interesting for the student to motivate them.	Trained	4.52	.37	.83	.88
	Untrained	4.62	.60		

Table 4.2: Mean, Standard deviation and p-values for the statements related to factor of (instructional material).

Statements	Type	Mean	SD	t	p-value
You use various books for instruction beside text books	Trained	4.05	1.08	50	.61
	Untrained	4.14	1.21		
You give explanation of important point on the blank board.	Trained	3.74	1.08	.89	.37
	Untrained	3.56	1.18		
You give feedback to students in their homework dairy.	Trained	4.47	.59	.10	.91
	Untrained	4.48	.53		
You use picture for explanation	Trained	4.10	.64	0.43	.66
	Untrained	4.05	.62		

Table 4.3: Mean, Standard deviation and p-values for the statements related to factor of (task orientation).

Statements	Type	Mean	SD	t	p-value
You utilize your time properly	Trained	4.69	.50	.92	.35
	Untrained	4.60	.52		
You give individual attention to	Trained	4.28	.89	2.7	.01
The student where necessary.	Untrained	4.65	.60		
You manage your class properly	Trained	4.48	.53	.19	.85
	Untrained	4.46	.73		
You give assignment to the students.	Trained	4.29	.77	.45	.65
	Untrained	4.22	.94		
You are punctual in taking class.	Trained	4.76	.43	1.2	.23
	Untrained	4.65	.54		
You keep discipline during the class	Trained	4.66	.47	.36	.72
	Untrained	4.62	.60		
You inform parents at appropriate time	Trained	4.57	.56	1.1	.25
About their children.	Untrained	4.44	.61		
You come to the class in time	Trained	4.72	.45	.83	.40
	Untrained	4.6	.51		
You mange the departure of student	Trained	4.10	.78	1.1	.26
	Untrained	4.25	.69		
Task orientation	Trained	4.49	.41	0.3	.72
	Untrained	4.46	.40		

Table 4.4: Mean, Standard deviation and p-values for the statements related to factor of (use of students ideas and contribution).

Statement	Type	Mean	SD	t	p-Value
You daily evaluate previous	Trained	4.31	.62	1.25	.25
Knowledge of students.	Untrained	4.14	.82		
You give feed back to Students on their home	Trained	4.43	.56	.52	.60
work	Untrained	4.32	.75		
You give appropriate time to students for	Trained	4.50	.62	.42	.67
discussion	Untrained	4.73	4.0		
You encourage students questions	Trained	4.47	.68	.52	.60
	Untrained	4.40	.75		
You give punishment and reward to the students.	Trained	4.31	.79	.56	.57
	Untrained	4.22	.90		
You satisfy the question of the students	Trained	4.33	.65	.85	.39
	Untrained	4.21	.88		
You arrange different activities according to their	Trained	4.07	.89	.21	.82
lesson properly	Untrained	4.03	.98		
You appreciate cooperative learning trained	Trained	4.64	.58	.03	.97
among students	Untrained	4.63	.48		
Use of students ideas and contribution	Trained	4.34	.44	0.44	.65
	Untrained	4.29	.73		

CONCLUSIONS
On the basis of findings the following conclusions were drawn, by comparing the teaching effectiveness of trained and untrained teachers through four factors, i.e., lesson plan, instructional material, task orientation and students' ideas and contribution, it was found that for all above mentioned factors there was no significant difference between the effectiveness of trained and untrained teachers

RECOMMENDATIONS
To further enhance the teaching effectiveness, enthusiastic teachers must be recruited, and should be assessed for their skills and competency in vocabulary, pronunciation, grammar and content delivery etc. Teachers' training workshops should be frequently conducted by the institute to improve teaching effectiveness, through different aspects, i.e., assessing students' results, when making decisions about

students' progress, teaching plans, developing and implementation of curriculum, organizing co-curricular activities etc. Teachers must be aware of the latest methodologies and teaching techniques to fortify their lessons. Teachers must also take a feedback from students' families to better understand their psychologies and upbringing to plan the lessons accordingly and effectively. A replica study with addition of other factors affecting the teaching effectiveness, must also be conducted in public schools to better understand any similarities or differences in the results and their causes affecting teaching effectiveness for trained and untrained teachers.

REFERENCES

1. Alderman, H., Orazem ,P. F .and Pterno ,E. M., "School Quality, School Cost, and the public/private School Choices of Low-Income Households IN Pakistan," *The Journal of Human Resources*, **36** (2):304-326(2001)
2. Arif, G. M. & Saqib, N., "Production of Cognitive Life Skills in public, private, and NGO Schools in Pakistan," *Pakistan Development Review*, **42**(1):1-28(2003)
3. Pru, L., "Characteristics of an Effective School Administrator's Leadership: University College Falmouth," (2007)
4. *Definition of teacher. Retrieved from http://www.question.com*
5. Loucks-Horsely, S., Hewson, P., Love, N. & Stiles, K., "Designing Professional Development for Teachers of Mathematics and Science," *Corwin Press,Thousand Oaks,CA*,(2003)
6. Papa, J., Effective Communication for School Administrations:" *Oral Roberts University*,(2011)
7. Hawley, W.& Valli, L., "The essentials Of Effective Professional Development:" *A new consensus in Teaching as the Learning profession:Handbook of Policy and Practice,* PP:151-80(1999)
8. Walberg, H. J. & Wang, H. J., "Instructional theories and research evidence: Adapting instruction to individual differences:" PP 3-23: Berkeley, CA: *Mc Cutchan Publishing Corporation*.
9. Aderson, L. W., Increasing Effectiveness.*(Second Edition)Paris :UNESCO,ILEP,* (2004)
10. Mujis, D. & Reynolds, D., "Effective Teaching:" *Evidence and Practice. London:Sage.*(2010)